

Evaluating Arguments - Insulin Example

Argument A

Insulin that is made by inserting the human insulin gene into bacteria or yeast cells is a better medication for diabetic people than insulin isolated from pigs or cows. The insulin from both pigs and cows has a different amino acid sequence than human insulin, and it triggered an allergic reaction in some patients. Since all living things read information in genes the same way, the bacteria or yeast should make insulin from the human gene the same way cells in the pancreas do. Because this insulin will have the same amino acid sequence as natural human insulin, the diabetic person's immune system will be less likely to recognize it as foreign. Insulin that is less likely to trigger an allergic reaction is a better medication.

Argumentation Checklist

Yes	No	CLAIM	NOTES
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Is there a clearly stated claim?	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Is it consistent with all of the available evidence?	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Is it the simplest conclusion based on all of the available evidence?	
EVIDENCE			
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Is there enough evidence to support the claim?	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Is all of the evidence relevant to the claim (there are no extra facts)?	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Do the data collection, analysis, and interpretation seem reasonable?	
REASONING			
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Is there enough reasoning to justify why the evidence supports the claim?	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Is the reasoning related to the claim?	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Is it related to the evidence?	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Is it consistent with accepted science ideas?	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Does it use facts, not feelings (system 2 thinking, not system 1)?	

Argument B

Insulin isolated from pigs or cows is a better medication for diabetic people than insulin made in bacteria or yeast cells. Single-celled bacteria and yeast do not have pancreas glands, and they do not normally make insulin. Pigs and cows are vertebrates, and their pancreas glands naturally make insulin. Insulin from pigs or cows is more natural than insulin made from yeast or bacteria.

Since natural products are better than synthetic ones, insulin from pigs or cows would be a better medication for diabetic people. We also already eat cows and pigs, and it would be better to not waste the natural products that could be made from the parts people don't usually eat and would otherwise throw away.

Argumentation Checklist

Yes	No	CLAIM	NOTES
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Is there a clearly stated claim?	
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Is it consistent with all of the available evidence?	
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Is it the simplest conclusion based on all of the available evidence?	
		EVIDENCE	
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Is there enough evidence to support the claim?	
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Is all of the evidence relevant to the claim (there are no extra facts)?	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Do the data collection, analysis, and interpretation seem reasonable?	
		REASONING	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Is there enough reasoning to justify why the evidence supports the claim?	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Is the reasoning related to the claim?	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	<input type="checkbox"/>	Is it related to the evidence?	
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Is it consistent with accepted science ideas?	
<input type="checkbox"/>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Does it use facts, not feelings (system 2 thinking, not system 1)?	